Interactive comment on “Bimodality of woody cover and biomass in semi-arid regime” by Z. Yin et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 1 March 2014

This paper is interesting and it addresses the well-know, and widely studied, problem of savanna dynamics and tree-grass coexistence. It is very interesting the distinction between horizontal and vertical structure.

On the other hand, other works (eg, Baudena et al 2009) find bimodality (in that case, associated with bistability) without the need for disturbances, and introducing the distinction between adult trees and seedlings, taking into account the differences in competition with grass. How do these results relate to the other mechanisms which have been proposed? How can one distinguish between the different mechanisms?

Finally, the paper is plagued with a continued use of too many acronyms which make it very difficult to read. Streamlining the presentation and reducing the jargon/acronyms would help.